Intersectorality “next generation”. A real way to tackle health inequalities?: Brazilian case

EUPHA HPS Pre-Conference
UNESCO Global Health & Education Chair
Marseille, France

20 de novembro de 2019
“I don't want to tell you my great love
From the things I learned from the vinyl records
I want to tell you how I lived
ALTHOUGH
My pain is to realize
That even though we did everything we did
We are still the same and we live
We are still the same and we live
Like our parents ...”

From the Song: “Como nossos pais” (Like our parents)
Elis Regina
Why can't there be peace and harmony in the world, Father?

Peace can be possible, Hamlet...

... but there will never be harmony...

... there are many people to chant the same song.
What to discuss with you?

- What do we really expect for a “new generation” of INTERSECTORIALITY?
- What are we doing in Brazil, in general, for INTERSECTORALITY?
- What are we doing, in particular, for children and adolescents?
- Which case did I choose to dig a little deeper?
- What next?
Suggesting some conditions for a “new generation” of INTERSECTORIALITY

- That we do not treat intersectorality as a panacea for addressing inequalities;
- That we understand that intersectoriality does not necessarily reduce the conflicts inherent in human relationships (it may increase them!!!);
- That intersectoral action does not presupposes given up sectoral responsibilities;
- That sector articulation should be a “fruit salad” and not a “fruit shake”;
- That, maybe, we need a theoretical framework for Intersectoriality.
The "annoying" distance between "our prescriptions" and life as it is

- There is no way to ignore that conflicts of interest and power pervade every human endeavor.
- It is naive to think that an intersectoral “prescription” would be an effective vaccine to immunize this constitutive element of human relations.
- But we can't turn we back on the fact that those with the most power resources will receive the largest share of the available resources, while the weaker will have to compete for the leftovers.

In search of a theoretical path

- “What”: which frameworks;
- “How”: which methodologies;
- “With whom”: which actors;
- “What for”: which intentions;
- “Why”: which paradigms.

*Mendes e Akerman, 2007*
What are we doing in Brazil, in general, for intersectorality?
66% of the papers I reviewed are from the last 20 years

I found 18 Policies, Programmes and Actions claimed to intersectoral:


Local Intesectoral Actions

Intersectorality in health in Brazil at the beginning of the XXI century: a portrait of experiences (Garcia et al, 2014)


Main findings: Lack of intersectorality definition; partnership with education sector present in 10 projects; no impact and sustainability assessments (Minimum: 1 year duration; Maximum 6 years duration)
Main Intersectoral “cases” with impact on child and adolescents

- **Cash Transfer (Bolsa Familia) (16 years)**
  World famous; many fragmented evaluation studies; evidence of good results;

- **Health Programme in Schools (12 years)**
  Not very famous; there is not a solid evaluation national study; evidence of not many good results;

- **Child Labour Erradication Programme (23 years)**
  Recognised worldwide as effective; an existing oficial national evaluation study; child labour is increasing in Brasil.
Which case did I choose to dig a little deeper?
PETI - Programa de Erradicação do Trabalho Infantil
Child Labor Eradication Program - PETI

It is an INTERSECTORAL program that, within the scope of the Unified Social Protection System, includes income transfers, social work with families and the provision of Living and Bonding Services for working children and adolescents. It has national coverage and it is developed in an articulation with the 27 states, with the participation of civil society.

Brasil, 2005
Partners in the Intersectoral Arrangement

- Office of the Presidency of the Republic
- Prosecution Office;
- Trade Unions (Workers; Employers);
- 27 States;
- 5570 municipalities;
- Private Sector;
- Civil Society.
STRATEGIC ACTIONS

**Intersetorial articulation protocol**

**I - Information/Mobilization**
- Sensibilização
- Mobilização Social
- Campanhas
- Grupos de Trabalho Intersetorial

**II - Identification**
- Busca Ativa
- Registro CADÚNICO

**III - Protection**
- Transferência de Renda
- Inserção em Serviços de Assistência Social e da rede intersetorial

**IV – Defence / Responsabilization**
- Fiscalização e autuação dos empregadores
- Medidas protetivas à família

**V - Monitoring**
- Ações estratégicas planejadas
- Sistema de Monitoramento do - SIMPETI
Evolution of child labor

Source: PNAD IBGE
The variation in child labor rates

Taxa de trabalho infantil - 1995
Fonte: Pesquisa Nacional por Amostra de Domicílios - PNAD

Taxa de trabalho infantil - 2015
Fonte: Pesquisa Nacional por Amostra de Domicílios - PNAD
LIO – Evaluation of the Latin American and Caribbean Regional Initiative free of Child Labor

- Countries: Brazil, Latin America and Caribe
- 40 days - February and March 2019
- Period analysed: 2009-2019 (municipalities with higher rates of child labour)
- Methods: DOCs, Workshops, Interviews
- Budget: Cooperation South-South
They assessed...

- Programme Relevance
- Design Validity
- Impact Orientation and Effectiveness
- Efficiency
- Management Efficacy
- Sustainability
Main Messages on evaluation of the INTERSECTORIALITY on Brazil Free of Child Labour

- Need for **greater role** for state, municipal and private sector actors;
- Continue to value **municipal intersectoral studies** as they expand the databases;
- Integrated intersectoral planning **favors program sustainability**;
- Sharing clearly the different responsibilities between the partners and **promoting the alternation of protagonism** reduces conflicts.
More messages...

- Intersectorality was most intense in the period from 2011 to 2015 mainly because it was implemented at the **territory level**;

- The intersectoral action of the program was strengthened when it **became part of the organic social welfare law**;

- Intersectoriality does not happen naturally, it needs to be deliberately built, it needs political will and professionals that make the articulation between the sectors, that act as **true tailors**.
What next?
If life is a game, why is it never my turn to play?
Suggesting 3 Generations for Intersctoriaty

1\textsuperscript{st} generation - Utilitarian: “If the state is weak and minimal, let us complement resources with other sectors and share responsibilities;

2\textsuperscript{nd} generation - Rationalizing: “Fragmentation in policies and actions compromises the efficiency and effectiveness of the state”;

3\textsuperscript{rd} generation - Generous Interdependence: “Intersectorality is not just the installation of multisectoral arrangements, but deliberate political decision to tackle inequalities”.
Let’s keep in touch

MARCO AKERMAN
marco.akerman@gmail.com
+55(11)9-7549-0011
Thank you very much!!!